



SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 1:

Journal Name:	<u>British Journal of Applied Science & Technology</u>
Manuscript Number:	2013_BJAST_5131
Title of the Manuscript:	OUTAGE ANALYSIS OF A MULTI-USER SPATIAL DIVERSITY SYSTEM IN A SHADOW-FADE PROPAGATING CHANNEL
Type of the Article	Research paper

General guideline for Peer Review process is available in this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)

- This form has total 7 parts. Kindly note that you should use all the parts of this review form.



SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 2: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Compulsory REVISION comments	1. Line-28: Protocol type (Reactive or Proactive) is not clear defined it. 2. No theoretical talk on Ad-Hoc network. 3. Broadcast domain is not defined. 4. How noise is ignored at the relay section? Give detail. 5. Line number 226-232 is not much clear would try to do. How exactly it acknowledge when link break.	1- The protocol type is discussed in details in the description of the paper, not in abstract. The type here is regenerative, rather than a simple relay. 2- I did not want to get into ad-hoc networks because while there are similarity with the multi-user diversity and ad-hoc, there are major differences as well. Ad-hoc networks are discussed in many recent publications and is a well-known topic . 3- Rather than looking at the broadcast domain similar to what is discussed in networking, the focus is on Physical Layer and a Shadow-Fade environment. This will not undermine any result obtained for outage probability and performance analysis.



SDI Review Form 1.6

		4- Since the method is regenerative, it is assumed that the noise is removed prior to re-transmission of the signal. 5- The paragraph is modified to make it clear.
--	--	---



SDI Review Form 1.6

Minor REVISION comments	1. Go again through the Reference paper number 5. 2. Less number of IEEE or standard journal survey.	The work by Laneman in the following paper is one of my favourite. J. N. Laneman, G. W. Wornell, "Exploiting Distributed Spatial Diversity in Wireless Networks," in Proc. of Allerton Conf. on Commun., Contr., and Computing, Urbana-Champaign, IL, Oct. 2000. More details on the above paper and the methodology is added to this work.
Optional/General comments	1. Always try to step out the algorithm or methodology in form of flow chart. 2. Mention simulation tool with version used for data analysis.	All the simulations in this paper is performed in MATLAB. In The revised version more description on the methodology is given.